Response to Office Son Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

REMARKS

In the office action mailed July 18, 2003, the Examiner rejected claim 52 under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph. Claims 25-27, 31-33, and 52 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 5,957,949 to Leonhardt in view of U.S. Patent No. 5,411,552 to Andersen. Applicants respectfully request reconsideration of the application in view of the following comments.

Rejection Under 35 U.S.C. §112

In the office action, the Examiner rejected claim 52 under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph, as allegedly failing to comply with the written description requirement. Claim 52 recites that the flow control device additionally comprises a frame coupled to the valve body. The Examiner asserted in paragraph 2 of the office action, that "the specification does not support the frame being coupled ("defined as "linked" or "connected") to the valve body."

Applicants respectfully disagree. Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary provides several definitions for the word "coupled", including "to connect for consideration together", "to join for combined effect", and "to fasten together." (See excerpt from Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, Tenth Edition, attached hereto as Exhibit A.) The specification provides support for the frame being "coupled" to the valve body under any of the foregoing definitions. Figures 1 and 2 of the specification, for example, show one possible embodiment of a flow control device where the valve body 24 is coupled to the frame 30 via a valve support 22. The valve support 22 provides a connection or a link between the valve body 24 and the frame 30. Although the valve body 24 and frame 30 are not directly contacting one another in Figures 1 and 2, Applicants note that

Response to Office Inton Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

the foregoing definitions do not require direct contact between two elements.

Thus, the frame 30 is shown "coupled" to the valve body 24 in Figures 1 and 2.

Figure 8 shows another embodiment of the flow control device wherein the frame is coupled to the valve body and directly contacts the valve body. As described in the last paragraph of page 7 (which extends through page 8) of the specification, Figure 8 shows a conically shaped portion 50 of the frame 46, which provides a passageway 52 for operation of the valve mechanism. As stated on page 8, lines 7-8, the "valve body 56 [of the frame 46] extends across the passageway 52." Thus, Figure 8 and the corresponding description describe another embodiment of a flow control device where the frame is coupled to the valve body, thereby providing further support for claim 52.

In support of the rejection of claim 52 under Section 112, the Examiner stated that "on page 6, lines 9-16 [of the specification], applicant teaches opposite of this claim limitation, specifically that a cylindrical element 36 between disk elements 38, 40 is used to separate the valve body from the seal, within which the frame is located." The examiner seems to imply that the use of the word "coupled" to describe two items precludes the two items from being separated by an intermediate item. However, the definitions of the word "coupled" do not provide such a preclusion and the examiner has provided no support for such an interpretation of the word "coupled." Thus, the description at page 6, lines 9-16, which describes an intermediate structure between the frame and valve body, is in no way at odds with the frame being "coupled" to the valve body.

The examiner further stated that "[t]he specification teaches separating the valve body and the frame so that the valve body will not be distorted when the

Response to Office Solon Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

frame expands." As discussed, use of the word "coupled" to describe two items does not preclude the two items from being physically separated, as it is still possible for the two items to be indirectly connected by an intermediate item. Nor does the use of the word "coupled" to relate the frame to the valve body indicate one way or the other whether the frame expansion distorts the valve body. Thus, although claim 52 recites that the frame is coupled to the valve body, the claim is silent as to whether or not the frame expansion distorts the valve body. Consequently, the use of the word "coupled" to relate the frame to the valve body is in no way opposite the description in the specification.

In view of the foregoing, applicants respectfully submit that the rejection of claim 52 under Section 112 should be withdrawn.

Rejection Under 35 U.S.C. §103(a)

Claims 25-27, 31-33, and 52 were rejected under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent No. 5,957,949 to Leonhardt in view of U.S. Patent No. 5,411,552 to Andersen. However, Applicant respectfully submits that the claims recite subject matter that is nether taught nor suggested by either Leonhardt or Andersen, both alone and in combination. For example, independent claim 25 recites the steps of placing in a pulmonic passageway a flow control device which has a <u>resilient</u> seal secured to a valve body. Both Leonhardt and Andersen fail to teach or suggest a flow control device which has a resilient seal. Accordingly, Applicants respectfully submit that the rejection of claims 25-27, 31-33, and 52 should be withdrawn.

Leonhardt describes a valve stent 20 comprised of three elements, including a stent 26, a biological valve 22, and graft material 24. In paragraph 4 of the office action, the examiner asserted that the graft material 24 corresponds

Response to Office Son Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

to the "resilient seal" of claim 25. However, unlike the resilient seal recited in claim 25, the graft material 24 is not resilient. Leonhardt describes the graft material 24 at column 5, lines 53-61, stating that the graft material 24 "is a thinwalled biocompatible, flexible and expandable, low-porosity woven fabric, such as polyester or PTFE." Nowhere in this description nor in any other part of the specification does Leonhardt state or even imply that the graft material 24 can be a resilient material. Indeed, at column 5, lines 59-61, Leonhardt states that the graft material 24 is tapered in order to prevent bunching of the graft material once placed in the patient. It is unlikely that a resilient material would bunch, as a resilient material would have the ability to recover its shape after deformation. This indicates that the graft material of Leonhardt is not resilient.

Rather than showing a graft material that is resilient, Leonhardt indicates that the graft material 24 is a material that passively conforms to the shape of the stent 26 to which it is attached. For example, Leonhardt describes at column 5, line 62 through column 6, line 8 how the graft material is attached to the stent 26 so that the material conforms tightly to the stent. Any resilient characteristics of the Leonhardt valve stent are provided solely by the stent 26, which is formed of a nitinol wire having superelastic characteristics. Leonhardt provides no suggestion or motivation for modifying the graft material to be resilient.

Andersen also fails to teach or suggest a flow control device which has a resilient seal that seals with a wall of a pulmonic passageway. Andersen describes a valve prosthesis for implantation in the body. The valve prosthesis includes a tubular means 24 having a cylinder surface that secures the valve prosthesis in a body channel by abutting the body channel. Anderson never shows that the tubular means is a resilient material. Rather, Andersen simply

Response to Office Solon Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

states that the cylinder surface is closed by a "suitable material." See Andersen, col. 4, lines 3-5. Moreover, Andersen has no suggestion or motivation to make the cylinder surface a resilient material. In view of the foregoing, the rejection of claim 25 under 35 U.S.C. §103(a) should be withdrawn.

Claims 26-27, 31-33, and 52 depend from claim 25 and all of these claims recite subject matter that is neither taught nor suggested by the cited art. In addition, these claims are patentable in view of their dependence on claim 25.

If the Examiner has any questions regarding the foregoing, she is cordially invited to contact the undersigned so that any such matters may be promptly resolved.

Respectfully submitted, HELLER, EHRMAN, WHITE & McAULIFFE LLP

Fred C. Hernandez

Registration No. 41,832

Attorney Docket No. 38349-102C

Address all correspondence to:
Stephanie L. Seidman
Fred C. Hernandez
HELLER EHRMAN WHITE & McAULIFFE LLP
4350 La Jolla Village Drive, Suite 700
San Diego, CA 92122-1246

Telephone: (858) 450-8400 Facsimile: (858) 587-5360

Response to Office Lon Gholam-Reza Zadno-Azizi, et al. U.S.S.N. 10/071,620

EXHIBIT A



Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary

TENTH EDITION

Merriam-Webster, Incorporated Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A.



A GENUINE MERRIAM-WEBSTER

The name Webster alone is no guarantee of excellence. It is used by a number of publishers and may serve mainly to mislead an unwary buyer.

Merriam-Webster, is the name you should look for when you consider the purchase of dictionaries or other fine reference books. It carries the reputation of a company that has been publishing since 1831 and is your assurance of quality and authority.

Copyright © 1996 by Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

Philippines Copyright 1996 by Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Main entry under title:

Merriam-Webster's collegiate dictionary. — 10th ed.

p.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-87779-708-0 (unindexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-709-9 (indexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-710-2 (deluxe : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-707-2 (laminated cover).

1. English language-Dictionaries. I. Merriam-Webster, Inc.

PE1628.M36

423—dċ20 ᢤ

Merriam-Webster's Collegiate® Dictionary, Tenth Edition principal copyright 1993

COLLEGIATE is a registered trademark of Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

All rights reserved. No part of this book covered by the copyrights hereon may be reproduced or copied in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, taping, or information storage and retrieval systems without written permission of the publisher.

Made in the United States of America

13141516RMcN96

confid ve created. They offer it to everywhere who need informaout the vocabulary of English, ssurance that it will prove a companion.

edition! Collections Fro several n years ago chirors, and Annous seaso neer than this cad this Zin noitian: babyoost a ine The

lo mon At not store วเของการเกา odt for the •01 78g t bas 20

:- sconun-c

48211.10

ate D: : we v

ublish

From

Merr:

Colle

er's C

ice, in

f an e

ial Pio

ok w ı of th

.dged,

to pre

of Wel

nary, i

orm,

peciall

.ange

atous

eless

s that

red y m-We

1ary,

n that

conte earchi

:w and

s root

m-We 1 the

id for

r and

nced,

n-Wel on th

Di

an

m \mathbf{n} o

а

m O

| Coun-try \kon-tr\(i\)\ n. pl countries [ME contree, fr. OF contr\(i\)\ e. fr. ML contrata, fr. L contra against, on the opposite side] (13c) 1: an indefinite usu. extended expanse of land; REGION 2 a: the land of a person's birth, residence, or citizenship' b: a political state or nation or its territory 3 a: the people of a state or district; POPULACE b: JURY c: ELECTORATE 2 4: rural as distinguished from urban areas 5: COUNTRY MUSIC—Country ish \urbancher terish\u00e4 adj \u2012-country adj (14c) 1: of, relating to, or characteristic of the country 2 a: of or relating to a decorative style associated with life in the country (an English \u2222 look); aiso: possessing a style of rustic simplicity (\u2222 furniture) b: prepared or processed with farm supplies and procedures (\u22222 ham) 3: of, relating to, suitable for, or featuring country music (\u22222 singers)

music (~ singers) and western n (1960): COUNTRY MUSIC — usu. hyphenated in

country and western n (1960): COUNTRY MUSIC — usu. hyphenated in attributive use country club n (1867): a suburban club for social life and recreation; esp: one having a golf course — usu. hyphenated in attributive use country—dance \(\nabla_{\text{soff}} \text{-} \data \data \text{-} \data \text{-} \data \data \data \data \text{-} \data \data

itants of a countryside tants of a country-wide \wide \wide

country—wom-an \kan-tre-;wu-man\ n (15c) 1: a woman compatriot 2: a woman resident of the country—country—kan-tre-independent of the country—country—kan-te\ n, pl counties [ME counte, fr. MF conte fr. ML comitations fr. LL, office of a count, fr. comitations country—more at count] (14c) 1: the domain of a count 2 a : one of the territorial divisions of England and Wales and formerly also of Scotland and Northern Ireland constituting the chief units for administrative; judicial, and political purposes b (1): the people of a country (2) **Prit* government within a state of the U.S. 4: the largest local administrative unit in various countries—country adj

government within a state of the U.S. 4: the largest local administrative unit in various countries—county adj. ²county n, pl counties [modif. of MF comte] (1550) archaic: ³COUNT county agent n (1705): a consultant employed jointly by federal and state governments to provide information about agriculture and home economics. ³

economics of county court n (1639): a court in some states that has a designated jurisdiction usu, both civil and criminal within the limits of a county county fair n (1856): a fair usu, held annually at a set location in a county esp. to exhibit local agricultural products and livestock county palatine n (150): the territory of a count palatine county seat n (1803): a town that is the seat of county administration county town n (1670) chiefly Brit: COUNTY SEAT [coupty k5p\ wb [ME, to strike, fr. MF couper — more at COPE] (ca. 1572) chiefly Scot: OVERTURN. UPSET [coup \kin\ n, pl coups \kin\ n, and usu, highly successful stroke of act 2: COUP DETAT

couple chapters are pretty good —E. B. White (letter) a couple wagons for hire —Garrison Keilloi). It is a couple wagons for hire —Garrison Keilloi). It is a hundred (a couple dozen).

cou-ple-ment (%-pol-mont) n [MF, fr. couples of the couple of the cou

cate or similar evidence of a purchase regemance in premium part of a printed advertisement to be cut off to use as an order part of a printed advertisement to be cut off to use as an order part of a printed advertisement to be cut off to use as an order part of a printed advertisement to be cut off to use as an order part of the courpon in a discount on merchandise (1) and the courpon in a printed or moral strength to resist opposition, danger, or hardship moral strength to resist opposition, danger, or hardship course in the courage to support unpopular causes). METTL SPRINT, RESOLUTION, TENACITY, moral strength to resist opposition, danger, or hardship course difficulty (the courage to support unpopular causes). METTL and in ingrained capacity for meeting strain or, difficulty, with formal and resilience (a challenge that will test your mettle), sprinted and resilience (a challenge that will test your mettle), sprinted and resilience (a challenge that will test your mettle), sprinted and resilience (a challenge that will test your mettle), sprinted and up one's morale when opposed or threatened (her sprint was united ends, (the resolution of pioneer women). TENACITY adds to resolution of pioneer women). TENACITY adds to resolution of subborn persistence and unwillingness long-different (held to their beliefs with great tenacity).

courageous (Na-Ta-jas) add (14de): having or characterized by age: BRAVE—courageous-ly adv—courageous-ness in courageous-ly adv—courageous-ly advaded by advaded by a courage ly advaded by a courage ly adv

people every tion about the voe bulers of the in the assurance that it will prove a reliable companion